# ANNUAL STATEMENT OF MICHIGAN CATASTROPHIC CLAIMS ASSOCIATION FOR THE YEAR ENDED JUNE 30, 2011

#### **IDENTIFICATION**

I, Roger M. Hayne, am associated with the firm of Milliman, Inc. I am a member of the American Academy of Actuaries and meet its qualification standards for Statements of Actuarial Opinion regarding fire and casualty insurance company statutory Annual Statements. I am a member in good standing and a Fellow of the Casualty Actuarial Society. I was appointed by the Board of Directors of Michigan Catastrophic Claims Association ("the Company") on December 15, 1993 to render this opinion.

The loss and loss adjustment expense reserves are the responsibility of the Company's management; my responsibility is to express an opinion on those reserves based on my review.

#### SCOPE

I have examined the reserves listed in Exhibit A, as shown in the Annual Statement of the Company as prepared for filing with state regulatory officials, as of June 30, 2011. The items upon which I am expressing an opinion, as shown in Exhibit A, reflect the disclosures shown in Exhibit B.

The Company writes no long duration contracts, defined as contracts, excluding financial guaranty contracts, mortgage guaranty contracts, and surety contracts, that fulfill both of the following conditions: (1) the contract term is greater than or equal to thirteen months and (2) the insurer can neither cancel nor increase the premium during the contract term.

In forming my opinion on the loss and loss adjustment expense reserves, I relied upon data and related information prepared by the Company. In this regard, I relied on James Lunsted, Controller, Michigan Catastrophic Claims Association as to the accuracy and completeness of the data. I evaluated the data used directly in my analysis for reasonableness and consistency. My evaluation did not reveal any data points materially affecting my analysis that fell outside of the range of reasonable possibilities. In performing this evaluation, I have assumed that the Company (a) used its best efforts to supply accurate and complete data and (b) did not knowingly provide any inaccurate data. I also reconciled the paid loss and loss adjustment expense amounts and case reserve amounts as of June 30, 2011 used in my analysis against Schedule P - Part 1 of the Company's current Annual Statement. In other respects, the analysis underlying my opinion included the use of such actuarial assumptions and methods and such tests of calculations as I considered necessary.

My review was limited to the items included in Exhibit A, and did not include an analysis of any income statement items or other balance sheet items. My opinion on the reserves is based upon the assumption that all reserves are backed by valid assets which have suitably scheduled maturities and/or adequate liquidity to meet cash flow requirements.

# ANNUAL STATEMENT OF MICHIGAN CATASTROPHIC CLAIMS ASSOCIATION FOR THE YEAR ENDED JUNE 30, 2011

#### **OPINION**

In my opinion, the sum of the amounts carried on account of Items 1. and 2., the sum of the amounts carried on account of Items 3. and 4., and the amount carried on account of Item 5., all as shown in Exhibit A:

- A. Meet the requirements of the insurance laws of the State of Michigan;
- B. Are consistent with reserves computed in accordance with Standards of Practice issued by the Actuarial Standards Board (including the Casualty Actuarial Society's Statement of Principles Regarding Property and Casualty Loss and Loss Adjustment Expense Reserves); and
- C. Make a reasonable provision for all unpaid loss and loss expense obligations of the Company under the terms of its contracts and agreements.

This opinion is made in accordance with the category "Determination of Reasonable Provision," as contained in the 2011 Property and Casualty Annual Statement Instructions regarding Statements of Actuarial Opinion.

#### **RELEVANT COMMENTS**

### Risk of Material Adverse Deviation

There are a variety of risk factors that expose the Company's reserves to significant variability. I have identified the major risk factors as uncertainty regarding economic conditions for 100 or more years into the future, potential changes in the social, legal and judicial climate in which the company operates and changes in the care and treatment of catastrophically injured claimants. The potential impact of these risk factors is described in more detail in the following paragraphs and in the report supporting this opinion. The absence of other risk factors from this listing does not imply that additional risk factors will not be identified in the future as being a significant influence on the Company's reserves.

The Company is liable to reimburse member insurers for all covered expenses incurred by qualifying claimants through their respective lifetimes without any monetary limit. As such, the Company's current liabilities could extend to payments more than one hundred years into the future. This extremely long potential payment tail, coupled with uncertainties in estimating payments that are far into the future, means that any estimate of the Company's liabilities is subject to substantial uncertainty.

Since the Company's reserves are carried on a discounted basis at an annual rate of 7.6%, as we understand is permitted for the Company by the Michigan Insurance Bureau, future economic conditions that affect the relationship between the rate of cost increase experienced on the

## ANNUAL STATEMENT OF MICHIGAN CATASTROPHIC CLAIMS ASSOCIATION FOR THE YEAR ENDED JUNE 30, 2011

Company liabilities and the return the Company can achieve on its assets can materially affect the adequacy of Company reserves. Future treatment of the Company claimants can affect both the costs of that treatment as well as the life expectancy of the Company claimants. This in turn can affect the Company's liabilities. Since the Company's obligations are defined by its enabling legislation, legislative and judicial actions, as in the case of USF&G v. MCCA and Michael Migdal, can also materially impact these liabilities.

The assumed interest rate is based on the Company's investment portfolio and reflects my assessment of expected performance given expected future increases in Company costs. They do not include any additional provision for adverse fluctuation or risk margin nor is there a risk margin, either implicit or explicit in my estimate of future expected losses. As a result, such discounted reserves are "an inadequate estimate of economic value" as indicated in Actuarial Standard of Practice No. 20, "Discounting of Property and Casualty Loss and Loss Adjustment Expense Reserves," promulgated by the Actuarial Standards Board.

I believe that the risk factors above, coupled with the variability that is inherent in any estimate of unpaid loss and loss adjustment expense obligations, could result in material adverse deviation from the carried net reserve amounts. By this, I mean that the probability of such a deviation occurring is not so low as to be remote. In making this determination, I have considered a material adverse deviation to be one in which the actual net unpaid losses and loss adjustment expenses exceed the total of Items 1. and 2. on Exhibit A by an amount greater than \$1,394,800,800.

This materiality standard, shown as Item 5 in Exhibit B, is equal to 10% of the Company's liabilities for losses and loss adjustment expenses shown on the Liabilities, Surplus and Other Funds page of the Annual Statement. The company has represented that the usual risk-based capital calculation is not applicable. As such I cannot comment on whether a movement in reserves of this magnitude will affect the Company's risk-based capital position. In selecting this materiality standard I considered several factors, such as the Company's reserve leverage ratio, the Company's history of reserve development, the policy limits and coverages written by the Company. My selection of the materiality standard was based on the fact that this opinion is prepared for the regulatory review of the Company. Other measures of materiality might be used for reserves that are being evaluated in a different context.

#### Uncertainty

In evaluating whether the reserves make a reasonable provision for unpaid losses and loss expenses, it is necessary to project future loss and loss adjustment expense payments. Actual future losses and loss adjustment expenses will not develop exactly as projected and may, in fact, vary significantly from the projections. Further, my projections make no provision for extraordinary future emergence of new classes of losses or types of losses not sufficiently represented in the Company's historical database or that are not yet quantifiable.

# ANNUAL STATEMENT OF MICHIGAN CATASTROPHIC CLAIMS ASSOCIATION FOR THE YEAR ENDED JUNE 30, 2011

#### Reinsurance

The Company has represented to me that it has no reinsurance protections. We also note the difference between the total of lines 1. and 2. and the total of lines 3. and 4. in Exhibit A is because the former total is discounted for interest and the latter is undiscounted.

#### IRIS Ratios

The booked reserves do not create exceptional values in the IRIS tests One-Year Reserve Development to Surplus, Two-Year Reserve Development to Surplus, and Estimated Current Reserve Deficiency to Surplus.

#### Methods and Assumptions

We continue to refine the methodology we use in evaluating reserves for the Company. Such refinements have not resulted in changes in reserve estimates that are material relative to the Company's surplus.

#### Other Disclosures

I recognize that the current book value of assets as presented in the June 30, 2011 Annual Statement of the Company is less than the total reserves in items 1 and 2 listed in Exhibit A. I note, however, that the legislation enabling the Company permits future assessments charged to member companies to include provision to reflect deficiencies in past assessments.

Our estimates reflect what we believe to be reasonable assumptions regarding future outcomes and are intended to provide a reasonable estimate of undiscounted future payments, net of reinsurance protections. Although we believe these estimates are reasonable, we must caution that the final settlement value of all claims is currently unknown and that with current knowledge some of the potential values of those amounts are probably more likely than others. We call this array of potential future outcomes along with their corresponding likelihoods the "distribution of outcomes." There currently is no recognized method or model to determine this entire distribution of outcomes for this book of liabilities, and as such we cannot characterize the estimates presented here as any statistic calculated from that distribution, nor can we compare these estimates with any such statistic. It is thus also impossible to say whether our estimates are actually biased either high or low, though our intention was to attempt to avoid both those situations.

## Salvage and Subrogation

The Company has represented that its total carried reserves are net of anticipated salvage and subrogation recoveries. The Company has represented to me that it does not reduce reserves to reflect anticipated salvage and subrogation recoveries.

# ANNUAL STATEMENT OF MICHIGAN CATASTROPHIC CLAIMS ASSOCIATION FOR THE YEAR ENDED JUNE 30, 2011

#### Discounting

I evaluated the loss and loss adjustment expense reserves on a discounted basis with regard to the time value of money. The Company has represented that it reduces reserves to reflect discounting.

The Company used an interest rate of 7.6% to discount reserves. The Company determined this interest rate after considering (1) the Company's portfolio performance and asset mix, (2) input from consulting actuaries and their economist, (3) input from the Company's investment committee and consultants, (4) input from the Company's actuarial committee, (5) historical long-term investment return data, and (6) long term economic predications. This interest rate has changed since the previous Annual Statement, from 7.1% in the previous statement to 7.6% here.

### Underwriting Pools and Associations

The Company has represented that it does not participate in pools and associations.

### Asbestos and Environmental Exposure

I have reviewed the Company's exposure to asbestos and environmental claims. In my opinion, there is a remote chance of material liability, since claim activity levels are minimal and the Company writes only reinsurance on automobile no-fault coverage.

#### Extended Loss and Expense Reserves

The Company has represented that it does not provide extended loss and expense coverage within professional liability claims-made contracts and therefore carries no extended loss and expense reserves.

## Contractual Liability for Service Contracts

The Company has represented that it does not provide contractual liability coverage for service contracts (vehicles, appliances, etc.).

#### Pre-Paid Loss Adjustment Expenses

The Company has represented that the reserve for unpaid loss adjustment expenses was established based on the estimated amount to adjust all open and unreported claims, regardless of pre-payments made to third party claims administrators.

# ANNUAL STATEMENT OF MICHIGAN CATASTROPHIC CLAIMS ASSOCIATION FOR THE YEAR ENDED JUNE 30, 2011

#### SUPPORTING DOCUMENTS AND USAGE

An actuarial report, including underlying actuarial work papers supporting the findings expressed in this Statement of Actuarial Opinion, will be provided to the Company to be retained for a period of seven years in the administrative offices of the Company and made available for regulatory examination.

This Statement of Actuarial Opinion is solely for the use of, and only to be relied upon by, the Company and the various state departments with which it files its Annual Statement.

Roger M. i

Milliman, Inc. 70 South Lake Avenue, Suite 1100 Pasadena, California 91101-4705

626.796.5985

roger.hayne@milliman.com

October 7, 2011

# ANNUAL STATEMENT OF MICHIGAN CATASTROPHIC CLAIMS ASSOCIATION FOR THE YEAR ENDED JUNE 30, 2011

## **EXHIBIT A: SCOPE**

	Loss Reserves:	<u>Amount</u>	
1.	Reserve for Unpaid Losses (Liabilities, Surplus and Other Funds page, Col. 1, Line 1)	\$13,743,306,000	HS
2.	Reserve for Unpaid Loss Adjustment Expenses (Liabilities, Surplus and Other Funds page, Col. 1, Line 3)	\$204,702,000	415
3.	Reserve for Unpaid Losses – Direct and Assumed (should equal Schedule P, Part 1, Totals from Cols. 13 and 15, Line12 * 1000)	\$71,579,443,000	MS
4.	Reserve for Unpaid Loss Adjustment Expenses – Direct and Assumed (should equal Schedule P, Part 1, Totals from Cols. 17, 19 and 21, Line 12 * 1000)	\$962,371,000	Al
5.	The Page 3 write-in item reserve, "Retroactive Reinsurance Reserve Assumed"	\$0	
6.	Other Loss Reserve items on which the Appointed Actuary is expressing an Opinion (list separately)	\$0	
•	Premium Reserves:		
7.	Reserve for Direct and Assumed Unearned Premiums for Long Duration Contracts	\$0	
8.	Reserve for Net Unearned Premiums for Long Duration Contracts	\$0	
9.	Other Premium Reserve items on which the Appointed Actuary is expressing an Opinion (list separately)	\$0	

# ANNUAL STATEMENT OF MICHIGAN CATASTROPHIC CLAIMS ASSOCIATION FOR THE YEAR ENDED JUNE 30, 2011

# **EXHIBIT B: DISCLOSURES**

1.	Name	of the Appointed Actuary	Hayne, Roger M.			
2.	The Appointed Actuary's Relationship to the Company		•			
	Enter I	or C based upon the following:	C			
	E	if an Employee; or				
	С	if a Consultant				
3.	The A	ppointed Actuary is a Qualified Actuary based upon what attacks.				
	Enter F	Enter F, A, M, or O based upon the following:				
	F	if an FCAS;				
	Α	if an ACAS;	F			
	М	if not a member of the CAS, but a Member of the American Academy of Actuaries approved by the Casualty Practice Council, as documented with the attached approval letter; or				
	0	for Other				
4.	Туре о	f Opinion, as identified in the OPINION paragraph.				
	Enter F	, I, E, Q, or N based upon the following:				
	R	if Reasonable;				
	I	if Inadequate or Deficient Provision;	R			
	E	if Excessive or Redundant Provision;				
	Q	if Qualified (use Q when part of the opinion is Qualified); or				
	N	if No Opinion				
5.	Materia Questic	lity Standard expressed in US dollars (used to answer on #6)	\$1,394,800,800			
6.	Is there a Significant Risk of Material Adverse Deviation?		Yes [X] No [ ] N/A [ ]			
7.	Statuto	Statutory Surplus (Liabilities, Col. 1, Line 37) \$(1,034,991,799				
8.	to loss	nted net salvage and subrogation included as a reduction reserves as reported in Schedule P (should equal Part 1 ry, Col 23, Line 12*1000)	\$0			

# ANNUAL STATEMENT OF MICHIGAN CATASTROPHIC CLAIMS ASSOCIATION FOR THE YEAR ENDED JUNE 30, 2011

# EXHIBIT B: DISCLOSURES (CONTINUED)

9.	Disc expe		
	9.1	Nontabular Discount [Notes, Line 32B23, (amounts 1, 2, 3 &4)], Electronic Filing Cols 7,8,9 & 10	\$58,593,806,000
	9.2	Tabular Discount [Notes, Line 32A23, (amounts 1&2)], Electronic Filing Cols 7 & 8.	\$0
10.	share asso in re	net reserves for losses and expenses for the company's e of voluntary and involuntary underwriting pools' and ciations' unpaid losses and expenses that are included eserves shown on the Liabilities, Surplus and Other Is page, Losses and Loss Adjustment Expenses lines.	\$0
11.	that on th	net reserves for losses and loss adjustment expenses the company carries for the following liabilities included ne Liabilities, Surplus and Other Funds page, Losses and Adjustment Expenses lines.	
	11.1	Asbestos, as disclosed in the Notes to Financial Statements (Notes, Line 33A03D, ending net asbestos reserves for current year) Electronic Filing Col. 11	\$0
	11.2	Environmental, as disclosed in the Notes to Financial Statements (Notes, Line 33D03D, ending net environmental reserves for current year) Electronic Filing Col. 11	\$0
12.	The (Grea	total claims made extended loss and expense reserve ater than or equal to Schedule P Interrogatories).	
	12.1	Amount reported as loss reserves	\$0
	12.2	Amount reported as unearned premium reserves	\$0
13.		r items on which the Appointed Actuary is providing vant Comment (list separately)	\$0